JOURNAL OF SOCIAL RESEARCH DEVELOPMENT
www.jsrd.org.pk   editor@jsd.org.pk

TEACHERS' PERCEPTION ABOUT ORGANIZATIONAL POLITICS & ITS RELATIONSHIP WITH TEACHERS' PERFORMANCE: THE APPLICABILITY OF MOA MODEL

Amjad Hussain[1], Nighat Ara[2] & Ali Gul Bugti[3]

[1]Deputy Director, Punjab Education Initiative Management Authority, Lahore, Pakistan
[2]Lecturer in Education, Government Islamia Graduate College (W), Lahore, Pakistan
[3]Assistant Professor in Education, University of Sufism & Modern Sciences, Sindh, Pakistan

KEYWORDS	ABSTRACT
Organizational Politics, Motivation, Opportunity, Ability, MOA Model	The motivation, opportunity and ability model for teachers' performance is related to the employees' long-term performance and competitiveness. The purpose of the study was to investigate the perceptions of teachers about organizational politics by finding out the relationship amid organizational politics, teachers' performance, and motivation, opportunity, and abilities (MOA) model. Quantitative survey research design was employed for this study. The sample was comprised of 15 public & 15 private schools of district Lahore. The data were collected using a self-developed questionnaire. The data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics. The results indicated that school teachers observed a strong culture of organizational politics. Results showed that there is positive relationship amid teachers' performance and MOA model and thus related to organizational politics. The findings of study will enhance understanding of teachers' performance in MOA model & politics & interrelationship with individual performance. Teacher's performance can be increased with the use of MOA model in the institutions.
ARTICLE HISTORY	
Date of Submission: 25-04-2024 Date of Acceptance: 29-05-2024 Date of Publication: 30-05-2024	2024 Journal of Social Research Development
Correspondence	Amjad Hussain
Email:	amjadmsba@gmail.com
DOI	https://doi.org/10.53664/JSRD/05-02-2024-07-84-95

INTRODUCTION

Motivation-Opportunity-Ability (MOA) model, initially introduced by Gruen, Osmonbekov and Czaplewski (2005) in the context of information processing, has since been widely adopted across various fields. This model posits that motivation, opportunity, and ability are intertwined aspects of behavior and experience (Anna, Keith, Kenneth & Trullen, 2023). In the realm of education, MOA model has proven to be instrumental in understanding and enhancing teacher performance, which is intrinsically linked to long-term employee effectiveness and competitiveness (Vedhathiri, 2020).

Motivation, the basis of MOA model, serves as driving force behind goal-oriented behavior. While motivation can be both intrinsic and extrinsic, intrinsic motivation, stemming from personal interest and enjoyment, is often considered more potent. Motivation is reason that helps person to show his talent or skill when he/she is sharing their knowledge. Ability, third pillar of MOA model, refers to skills, talents & competencies that individuals possess. Low motivation does not devote much energy & person might focus on using shortcuts that can be due to degree of prospect or involvement i.e. if job is a hobby for the person naturally his motivation level will be low showing his less potential of sharing knowledge towards working environment (Baumhof, Decker, Röder & Menrad, 2018). Job satisfaction has the positive correlation with self-esteem of teachers (Anwar, Jamil, Farooqi, Akram & Mehmood, 2015).

A motivated teacher is more likely to invest energy, seek innovative solutions and share knowledge effectively, thereby fostering positive and productive learning environment (Layek & Koodamara, 2024). The opportunity to apply one's abilities is another critical component of the MOA model. In context of teaching, this translates to availability of resources, support, and conducive environment that allows teachers to utilize their skills and knowledge to the fullest. Research suggests that when teachers are provided with ample opportunities for the professional development and growth, their motivation and job satisfaction increase, leading towards improved performance (Xie, Chen, Peng & Zhang, 2023). The opportunity to avail the potential is largely a function of self-recognition and that potential in person is goal-oriented and is of great value when a person shares their knowledge (Shara, 2022). In this linking, the objective of this inquiry is to illustrate the correlation between the MOA prototype, teacher performance, and organizational politics. In the teaching profession, this encompasses pedagogical knowledge, subject matter expertise, and classroom management skills. While ability is a prerequisite for effective teaching, it is not sufficient in isolation. Motivation and opportunity must also be present for teachers to fully leverage their abilities and achieve optimal performance (Tuuli & Rhee, 2021). Yet, how the MOA model influences the teachers' performance is not always clear.

Teachers' performance showed that process by which knowledge is recombined & globalized favors certain organizations allowing individuals within these organizations to create & share knowledge more effectively and efficiently (Yee, Tan, Nasurdin, Yeo & Ramayah, 2020). The organizational politics, a process where employees attempt to affect others' behavior in pursuit of job-related goals and devices like power struggles, favoritism, hidden agendas can greatly affect work environment & subsequently teacher performance. Having atmosphere of organizational politics can undermine motivation employees have, limit opportunities given to them, & hinder their ability to effectively use their job-related skills, all of which ultimately affect teaching and learning (Mohammad, Sajid & Jamil, 2022). Among the leading promoters of employee performance is recognition for job well done or appreciation for work performed and feedback (Anwer et al., 2015). Through examination of how these elements intersect and function with one another, this research is striving to produce useful information for those operating school systems and creating policies. Knowledge in arena of MOA, and office politics may lend itself to difference in developing tactics and proposed actions for enhancing effectiveness of educators and developing healthy school environment, so escalating the outcome of students.

Objectives of Study

1. To investigate the teachers' perceptions about the organizational politics in the schools.
2. To find out relation amid teacher performance, organizational politics & (MOA) model.

Research Question

3. What are the school teachers' perceptions about organizational politics in the schools?
4. What is linkage amid teachers' performance, organizational politics & (MOA) model?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Several researchers and authors on educational matters have brought forth variables that affect the academic performance (Arshad et al., 2021; Gumasing & Castro, 2023; MacCann et al., 2020; Wu et al., 2020). Even teachers at all levels aim to motivate their students to pass well and have better grades in their examinations. Motivation helps us to reach goals & consists of suitable instruments of responses stimulated by the internal force that start us to satisfy some needs sometimes we may be completely aware of needs and our actions will consciously move to aim to satisfy them (Filgona et al., 2020). For example, a hungry child eats food knowing full well that it will quell their hunger. Education is driven by the thirst for knowledge. Motivation can be anything from a prize to a threat. Motivation starts from a variety of sources (wants, perceptions & emotions), these internal processes stimulate human behavior in many ways for example starting, sustaining, intensifying, maintaining, and stopping it (Bhatt, 2024). The MOA model is sharing reviews identifying with enhancing the teacher performance. Motivation is an integral segment of the MOA system, and the investigation of motivation has coordinated pertinence and application in flow away and flow social change. The motivation is an intricate idea and the level of motivation, and the kind of motivation included are vital contemplations.

The complementary dialog will consider characteristic and outward parts of motivation extraneous motivation can be characterized as an advertisement the kind of motivations that is controlled by the externalities that are not some portions of the action or behavior they are affecting (Layek & Koodamara, 2024). The utilization of motivators to energize and demoralize behavior is entrenched in teachers' performance. Some exemplary outward motivations are money-related prizes and the utilization of more mental motivators, for example, the opportunity to inspire others. An individual might be encouraged however this motivation may not prompt the behavior change if there are compelling variables. In a teacher performance setting, opportunity happens when the person is not constrained in their craving to act by elements in their outside condition. In this connection, these viewpoints incorporate data, time and money-related assets, and outside controls. The first premise of the MOA structure recommends that individual motivation to take part in a particular behavior significantly affects whether a behavior is to be performed. Late improvements in work motivation hypothesis propose to recognize two motivation sorts independent and controlled (Gagné & Deci, 2005). For instance, Bock et al. (2005) locate a negative impact of expected rewards on teachers' job performance.

The direct beneficial outcome of saw rewards on performance vanishes when different elements are included in model. There are relevant studies in previous literature. For example, in a recent study

by Xie et al. (2023), this theory of MOA has been explored in the pre-service teachers' behavioral intentions perspective regarding AI-integrated instruction. In the same way, this model is applied to evaluation of residents' participation in heritage rehabilitation (Benedjma & Mahimoud, 2021). In a study by Fan et al. (2024), the language role has been explored regarding this model to see the information-sharing patterns in the Chinese context. Research by Tuuli and Rhee (2021), seeks the theory regarding individual behaviors. In this linking, in Pakistani context, there are diverse studies conducted among the variables of the current study. In a study by Bukhari et al. (2021), the high-achieving students' motivation has been explored. Thus, few studies have explored organizational politics and organizational environment in the diverse contexts (Ismail, 2020; Sajid, Jamil, & Abbas, 2022; Sajid, Jamil, & Mohammad, 2022). Another study explores the impact of the teachers' work-family conflict on their children's performance (Sajid et al., 2022). Apart from the inquiries, further investigations have focused on how occupational culture and leadership impact teacher motivation as well as performance.

For one example, Waeyenberg et al. (2022) discovered that the teacher motivation, job satisfaction, and consequently student achievement flourish when teachers work in empowering and supportive school culture, where leadership is effective. Kaduma (2024) focused on the significance of intrinsic motivation for the teacher performance, implying that teachers who are genuinely passionate about their occupation, sustain higher levels of engagement, creativity, and effectiveness in teaching. The current study emphasizes teacher motivation and performance's complex nature and significance of interaction of organization, individual, and contextual factors. The positive or negative perceptions can significantly impact their motivation and effectiveness. Tripartite MOA model provides insight into such complexities, but the consideration of additional elements like the organizational culture, leadership, and intrinsic motivation are equally important for determining teacher outcomes and behavior. This includes various aspects such as instructional effectiveness, classroom management, student engagement, and overall contribution to school environment. Incorporating these diverse viewpoints can allow for more complete understanding of teacher motivation and performance and implementation of rich interventions and policies to enhance quality of education and ultimately student achievement.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A survey research design was used for this study. This design was chosen as it allowed for collection of perceptions of population (Creswell, 2021). A quantitative research design was employed. The target population was comprised of male and female teachers at secondary schools. The sample was selected using multistage sampling technique (Cohen et al., 2002). A total 30 schools were selected using a simple random sampling technique from district of Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. Researchers selected 10 teachers from each school using a purposive sampling technique. Purposive sampling is used when a researcher uses his/her prior knowledge about for selection of research participants (Etikan et al., 2016). A total of 300 teachers from secondary schools were included in sample. An effort was made to identify those teachers who would be available in school for most of day & could offer relevant information.

Instrumentation & Data Collection

For the collection of data, a self-developed questionnaire comprised of a five-point Likert scale was used which ranged from very seldom to very often. There were five sub-constructs in questionnaire e.g., motivation, opportunity, ability, teaching performance, and organizational politics. There were 30 items in the questionnaire. Therefore, the validity was ensured by experts' opinions and changes were made. The Cronbach's alpha test was used to determine the reliability of the items (Tavakol & Dennick, 2011).

Table 1 Reliability of questionnaire Sub-Constructs

SN	Construct Name	No. of Items	Cronbach Alpha
1	Motivation	5	α=.878
2	Opportunity	5	α=.790
3	Ability	4	α=.771
4	Teaching Performance	5	α=.922
5	Organizational Politics	11	α=.945

Table 1 shows the inter-item correlation of different sub-factors of the questionnaire. There were 5 sub-constructs (motivation, opportunity, ability, teaching performance, and organizational politics in the questionnaire. It showed that the Cronbach's alpha values of all the sub-constructs are within the range of 0.771 to 0.945. The values showed that all the items in each sub-construct were highly reliable. The response rate was 285 from 300 targeted respondents. Analysis of data incorporated frequency distribution, Mean, standard deviation, reliability analysis & correlation, by employing IBM Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS). Respondents table from both types of institutions is as follows:

DATA ANALYSIS

Table 2 Institutions & Respondents from Each Type of Institution

SN	Institution	Number of institutions	Number of Respondent
1	Public	15	150
2	Private	15	150
3	Total	30	300

The results provide important information in table 2 shows that there were 150 teachers from public schools and 150 from private secondary schools. In total, there were 300 teachers from Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan.

Table 3 Demographic Profile of Participants

Demographic Variable	Type	N	%
Gender	Male	117	41.1
	Female	168	58.9
Age	21-30	134	47.0
	31-40	110	38.6
	41-50	41	14.4

	51-60	~	~
Qualification	BA/BSc	37	13.0
	M.A/MSc	244	85.6
	M.Phil.	4	1.4
Teachers from Institutions	Public	150	52.2
	Private	135	47.4
Level of Teaching	Secondary Class	183	64.2
	Elementary Class	102	35.8

Table 3 shows the demographic information of the teachers. The responses are shown in the form of frequency & percentage. Among 285 respondents, there were 41.1 % male teachers and 58.9 % were female teachers. The age 47.0 % of the teachers ranged between 21 to 30 years old. Almost 38.6 % of teachers were between 31 to 40 years and 14.4 % of teachers were between 41 to 50 years. The qualification of 37 (13.0 %) teachers was BA/B.SC, 85.6 % were master's degree holders and 1.4 % teachers were M.Phil. It can be seen from table values that there were 150 teachers from public schools and 47.4 % teachers from private institutions. Thus, the above table shows that 64.2 % of the teachers were teaching secondary classes and 35.8 % were teaching elementary classes in the secondary schools.

Table 4 Descriptive Statistics for Teachers' MOA & Performance Factors

Construct	Mean	SD
Motivation	22.905	2.609
Opportunity	22.705	2.662
Ability	22.982	2.122
Teacher Performance	67.908	7.471

Table 4 reflects the descriptive statistics of the MOA model and teacher performance, it shows that the first factor is Mean=22.9 SD= 2.60, the second-factor opportunity average response is M=22.7, SD= 2.66, third sub factor i.e., ability mean =22.98, SD= 2.12 depicts that teacher found themselves motivated, utilizing opportunities and having abilities to perform a task., on the last sub-factor the mean value is significantly high (M= 67.908, SD=7.471). It showed that teachers perceive themselves as performing well.

Table 5 Perceptions of Teachers of Organizational Politics

Construct	Mean	SD
Organizational Politics	81.238	9.466

The above table shows teachers' perceptions of the presence of organizational politics in the institutes. The mean value of 81.238 and SD 9.466 reveals that teachers perceive that there is a strong culture and role of organizational politics.

Table 6 Relationships among Different Variables

SN	Variables	1	2	3	4	5
1	Motivation	1				

2	Opportunity	0.704**	1			
3	Ability	0.859**	0.859**	1		
4	Teaching Performance	0.832**	0.966**	0.927**	1	
5	Perception of organizational politics	0.687**	0.932**	0.882**	0.942**	1

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)
***Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed)

Pearson's correlation coefficient was used to assess the relationships among motivation, opportunity, ability, teaching practice, and perception of organizational politics (POP). The table shows a strong positive correlation between motivation and opportunity ($r = 0.704$, $p < .01$). Moreover, motivation was significantly positively correlated with ability ($r = 0.859$, $p < .001$), teaching practice ($r = 0.832$, $p < .001$), and POP ($r = 0.687$, $p < .001$). Also, ability was highly correlated with opportunity, ($r = .875$, $p < .001$), teaching experience ($r = 0.966$, $p < .001$), & Perceptions of organizational politics ($r = 0.941$, $p < .001$).

DISCUSSION

This research sought to deconstruct the interplay between MOA Model and teacher performance in educational settings. Our findings confirm previous evidence depicting that the teachers generally portray themselves as motivated, capable, and provided with professional development prospects (Waeyenberg et al., 2022). Thus, such self-assessed orientations appear to be in harmony with the fundamental tenets of MOA model, stating that when teachers intrinsically want, to bring along the needed skills, and make it available to apply their acquired know-how, they are more performant. These premises concur with recent finding by Kumar (2023) highlighting that intrinsic motivation critical factor that should be addressed to drive engagement, creativity, and efficacy for teachers. Critical thinking and creativity being 4Cs of twenty-first century have been focused in this studies (Hamna, Naseer & Jamil, 2021; Jamil, 2021; Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil, Bokhari, & Ahmad, 2024; Jamil, Bokhari, & Iqbal, 2024; Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil & Muhammad, 2019a, 2019b; Jamil et al., 2020; Jamil et al., 2021a, 2021b, 2021c; Jamil, Naima & Qureshi, 2021; Jamil, Masood, Habib, 2021).

Furthermore, significant positive correlation found between MOA model and teacher performance in this study echoes previous research findings. It underscores the importance of a supportive school environment that fosters motivation, provides opportunities, and recognizes abilities in contributing to improved teacher performance. This aligns with the conclusions of (Waeyenberg et al., 2022), who emphasized the role of the supportive and empowering school culture, coupled with effective leadership, in enhancing teacher motivation, job satisfaction, and student achievement. However, the results of this analysis also suggest that organizational politics may have a negative impact on teacher performance, even when an MOA is in place. This finding confirms the idea that education facilities in which manipulations are an inherent element and where power struggles abound can discourage teachers and obstruct their opportunities for accomplishment and proper use of their competence (Fan et al., 2024). This result therefore calls for leadership attention on the implications of politics, subsequent bureaucracy that can create a negative atmosphere and influence that can discourage performance.

In difference from prior research, that has mainly concentrated on social influence of organizations, the current study looks at what distinctive components contribute to organizational success in the global environment. It also examines effect of social conditions on this success. Finally, the present study overcomes earlier ambiguities in definitions of the organizational politics & performance by operationalizing these constructs in two separate stages. In stage 1, the new global construct, the perception of organizational politics (POP), is developed along three dimensions. In Stage 2, a basic level model of POP and performance is introduced. Also, this study builds on preceding studies, largely executed in foreign settings, by examining Pakistani schools. The obtained results provide instructive comprehension of exclusive tribulations and possibilities experienced by teachers vis-à-vis the MOA ideal and organizational politicking. By exploring the connections between teachers' perceptions of organization politics and performance over MOA model, stakeholders gain valuable insights into how to create more effective and positive work environments in schools. By considering such contextually rooted constituents, research increases depth of teacher performance in Pakistani educational milieu.

CONCLUSION

The objective of this study is to explore the relationship between motivation-opportunity-ability (MOA) model, teacher performance, and organizational politics as mediators. The sample was taken from the educational institutions of Lahore city of Punjab Pakistan. The study showed that teachers mostly perceive themselves as motivated, capable, and provided with opportunities for professional development. This perception is in line with the MOA model which reveals that if the teachers are intrinsically motivated, well-skilled, and have an opportunity to apply his/her knowledge for their performance will be enhanced. Moreover, there was a strong, significant and positive association between the MOA model and teacher performance. This indicates that a motivating, abundant, and opportunities-loaded atmosphere in school can increase teacher performance. Nevertheless, the study also asserts the potential dark side of organizational politics on the teacher performance. The consequence shows that when organizational politics surface, it has solved the effects of the MOA model. This also demonstrates that when a teacher has well motivation, ability, and opportunities in the job, if political activities & powers are fighting and dominating the organization; teacher would not perform well.

The implications for educational practice and policy derived from the results of study are several folds. First, they provide support for the value of fostering intrinsic motivation in teachers, which can be accomplished through providing opportunities for autonomy, acknowledging, and rewarding competence, creating a school culture that values collaboration and professional growth. Second, the results pointed to a need for extensive professional development and growth opportunities for teachers. It helps to implement mechanisms for teachers to provide feedback on the organizational policies, practices as school leaders trained to recognize & mitigate negative organizational politics. Understanding these dynamics can help school administrators develop interventions to improve the organizational climate, reduce negative perceptions of politics, enhance teachers' performance. These can include workshops, conferences, mentoring programs, and other strategies that enhance classroom effectiveness and expertise. Third, the study underscored the importance of dealing with politics in schools. This might entail inspiring openness & transparency in decision-making, change

of mechanisms for upward communication, and creation of the culture of trust and respect among all the constituencies.

Recommendations

1. The institutions can enhance access to workshops, conferences, etc. for continuous learning, professional development, and skills improvement of teachers.
2. A culture of respect can help accomplish close coordination and harmonious relationships between administrators and teachers. This can be done over collaboration and cooperative activities.
3. The administrators should recognize teacher utmost efforts in respective classrooms in formal or informal ways. It may include sincere verbal recognition or a form of reward.
4. The implementation of MOA model is big factor directly affecting the maximum performance of teachers. There should be enough autonomy and chances for employing creative teaching methods in the classroom.
5. The schools are recording school-level policy, all involved in education call for transparency in decision-making. Teachers should be seen as involved in the meetings.

REFERENCES

Anna, N., Keith, T., Kenneth, C., & Trullen, J. (2023). Examining the Ability, Motivation and Opportunity (AMO) framework in HRM research: Conceptualization, measurement and interactions. *International Journal of Management Review*, 1–15.

Anwer, M., Jamil, M., Farooqi, M. T. K., Akram, M., & Mehmood, N. (2015). How does job satisfaction relate with self-esteem of teachers. *AYER*, 3(1), 52-57.

Arshad, M., Muhammad, Y., & Qureshi, N. (2021). The Influence of Parent-Teacher Meetings on Early.

Baumhof, R., Decker, T., Röder, H., & Menrad, K. (2018). Which factors determine the extent of house owners' energy-related refurbishment projects? A Motivation-Opportunity-Ability Approach. *Sustainable Cities and Society*, 36, 33-41.

Benedjma, I., & Mahimoud, A. (2021). Applying the MOA (motivation-opportunity-ability) model for the evaluation of residents' participation in built heritage rehabilitation: The case of Constantine. *Journal of Cultural Heritage Management and Sustainable Development*, 11(1), 18-38.

Bhatt, S. (2024). The Self Esteem & Motivation for College Success. The Orange Books Publication.

Bock, G. W., Zmud, R. W., Kim, Y. G., & Lee, J. N. (2005). The Behavioral intention formation in knowledge sharing: Examining the roles of extrinsic motivators, social-psychological forces, and organizational climate. *MIS quarterly*, 87-111.

Bukhari, S., Butt, S., & Muhammad, Y. (2021). Understanding Academic Motivation of High Achieving Students with Hearing Impairment in Higher Education: A Qualitative Study. *Global Sociological Review*, 6(2), 17-25.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2002). Research methods in education. *Routledge*. Creswell, J. W. (2021). A concise introduction to mixed methods research. *SAGE publications*.

Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., & Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American journal of theoretical and applied statistics*, 5(1), 1-4.

Fan, S., Yao, S., & Wu, D. (2024). The role of languages: adopting the motivation-opportunity-ability (MOA) model to explore information sharing patterns among multilingual users in the Chinese cultural context. Library Hi Tech.

Filgona, J., Sakiyo, J., Gwany, D., & Okoronka, A. (2020). Motivation in learning. *Asian Journal of Education and social studies*, 10(4), 16-37.

Gagné, M., & Deci, E. L. (2005). Self-determination theory and work motivation. *Journal of Organizational behavior*, 26(4), 331-362.

Gruen, T. W., Osmonbekov, T., & Czaplewski, A. J. (2005). How e-communities extend the concept of exchange in marketing: An application of the motivation, opportunity, ability (MOA) theory. *Marketing Theory*, 5(1), 33-49.

Gumasing, M. J. J., & Castro, F. M. F. (2023). Determining ergonomic appraisal factors affecting the learning motivation and academic performance of students during online classes. *Sustainability*, 15(3), 1970.

Hamna Naseer, Y. M., & Jamil, M. (2021). Critical thinking skills in Pakistan studies textbook: Qualitative content analysis. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 4(3), 744-755.

Ismail, M. (2020). The Mediating Role of Organizational Politics in the Relationship between Knowledge Sharing and Teacher Performance: An application of MOA Model. *Social And Basic Sciences Research Review*, 1(1), 31-45.

Jamil, M. (2021). An analysis of education policy and science teachers' practices for developing critical thinking skills in secondary school students, [PhD dissertation, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan].

Jamil, M., Anwar, M., & Ali, M. J. (2024). Developing critical thinking skills in english classrooms at the secondary level: Teachers' perspective. *Journal of Social Sciences Development*, 3(1), 76-85.

Jamil, M., Aslam, M., & Ali, S. (2024). Single national curriculum (SNC) for social studies (2020): Document analysis for development of critical thinking skills at the primary level. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(2), 67-74.

Jamil, M., Bokhari, T. B., & Ahmad, D. (2024). Evaluation of Critical Thinking Elements: A Qualitative Content Analysis of Physics Textbook Grade IX. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(1), 344-350.

Jamil, M., Bokhari, T. B., & Iqbal, J. (2024). Incorporation of critical thinking skills development: A case of mathematics curriculum for grades I-XII. *Journal of Asian Development Studies*, 13(1), 375-382.

Jamil, M., Bokhari, T. B., & Rafiq, M. (2024). Critical thinking skills development for 21st century: An analysis of Biology curriculum (2006). *Voyage Journal of Educational Studies*, 4(1), 127-138.

Jamil, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019a). Teaching science students to think critically: Understanding secondary school teachers' practices. *Journal of Research & Reflections in Education (JRRE)*, 13(2), 256-272.

Jamil, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019b). Teaching Science Students to Think Critically: Understanding Secondary School Teachers' Practices. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 13(2), 256-272.

Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., Masood, S., & Habib, Z. (2020). Critical thinking: A qualitative content analysis of education policy and secondary school science curriculum documents. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education,* 14(2), 249-258.

Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., & Qureshi, N. (2021a). Critical thinking skills development: Secondary school science teachers' perceptions and practices. *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research (SJESR),* 4(2), 21-30.

Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., & Qureshi, N. (2021b). Secondary school science teachers' practices for the development of critical thinking skills: An observational study. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences,* 2(4), 259-258.

Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., & Qureshi, N. (2021c). Secondary School Science Teachers' Practices for the Development of Critical Thinking Skills: An Observational Study. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences,* 2(4), 259-265.

Kaduma, K. D. (2024). Compliance toward ethical leadership among school principals: A synthesis of qualitative research-based evidences.

Kumar, J. (2023). Influence of motivation on teachers' job performance. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications,* 10(1), 1-11.

Layek, D., & Koodamara, N. K. (2024). Motivation, work experience, and teacher performance: A comparative study. *Acta Psychologica,* 245, 104217.

MacCann, C., Jiang, Y., Brown, L. E., Double, K. S., Bucich, M., & Minbashian, A. (2020). Emotional intelligence predicts academic performance: A meta-analysis. *Psychological bulletin,* 146(2), 150.

Mohammad, N., Sajid, I. S., & Jamil, M. (2022). The Teachers' Empowerment and Organization. Sage.

Muhammad Jamil, Y. M., Naima Qureshi. (2021). Critical Thinking Skills Development: Secondary School Science Teachers' Perceptions and Practices. *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research,* 4(2), 21-30.

Muhammad Jamil, Y. M., Sajid Masood, Zahida Habib. (2021). Critical Thinking: A qualitative content analysis of education policy and secondary school science curriculum documents. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education,* 14(2), 249-258.

Sajid, S., Jamil, M., & Abbas, M. (2022). Relationship between organizational environment and teacher's citizenship behaviour at public universities of Punjab. *Global Educational Studies Review,* 7(2), 192-200.

Sajid, S., Jamil, M., & Mohammad, N. (2022). Exploring Organizational Environment of Public Universities of Punjab. *Global Educational Studies Review,* 7(2), 456-466.

Sajid, S. M., Jamil, M., & Abbas, M. (2022). Impact of teachers' work-family conflict on the performance of their children. *Jahan-e-Tahqeeq,* 5(1), 229-239.

Shara, T. (2022). Autonomous Motivation: A Structured Literature Review and Research Implication for the Business Environment. *PQDT-Global.*

Tavakol, M., & Dennick, R. (2011). Making sense of Cronbach's alpha. *International Journal of Medical Education,* 2, 53.

Tuuli, M. M., & van Rhee, H. (2021). How ability, motivation, and opportunity drive individual performance behaviors in projects: Tests of competing theories. *Journal of Management in Engineering,* 37(6), 04021070.

Van Waeyenberg, T., Peccei, R., & Decramer, A. (2022). Performance management and teacher performance: Role of affective organizational commitment and exhaustion. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 33(4), 623-646.

Vedhathiri, T. (2020). An Integrated Model for Improving the Performance of Engineering Institutes under Multiple External and Internal Disruptions. *Procedia Computer Science*, 172, 1084-1095.

Wu, H., Li, S., Zheng, J., & Guo, J. (2020). Medical students' motivation and academic performance: the mediating roles of self-efficacy and learning engagement. *Medical education online*, 25(1), 1742964.

Xie, S., Chen, X., Peng, S., & Zhang, S. (2023). Pre-Service Teachers' Behavioral Intention for AI-Integrated Instruction: A Path Analysis of the Theory of Motivation-Opportunity-Ability (MOA). 2023 5th International Conference on Computer Science and Technologies in Education (CSTE),

Yee, Y. M., Tan, C. L., Nasurdin, A. M., Yeo, S. F., & Ramayah, T. (2020). Building a knowledge-intensive medical device industry: The effect of knowledge creation in R&D project performance. *Jurnal Pengurusan*, 58, 119-131.