




EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT: AN ANALYSIS OF ENGLISH TEXTBOOK GRADE-V

Muhammad Jamil¹, Farwa Khalil² & Zainab Noorani³

¹Lecturer, Department of Education, GC Women University Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan

²MPhil Education, University of Education, Division of Education, Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

³PhD Scholar, Department of Education, Sindh Madressatul Islam University, Karachi, Pakistan

KEYWORDS	ABSTRACT
Sustainable Development, English Textbook, Social Responsibility, Cultural Diversity, Values Education	The current research adopted qualitative content analysis with the help of NVivo 12 software and a purposive sampling technique to select a Grade 5 English textbook. The main purpose of study was to analyze the document regarding six aspects of sustainability by Tawanti framework. Findings of study revealed that sustainability has been viewed holistically consisting of environmental, social, economic, institutional, cultural and values-based approaches. The study of textbook revealed that most parts of the textbook were seen promoting the environmental awareness, gender equality, social responsibility, financial literacy, national pride, cultural diversity & values. Furthermore, specific lessons and activities were also found in the textbook to offer knowledge and training related to sustainable practices, empathy, ethical decision making & cultural heritage of Pakistan. It was concluded that the textbook of Grade 5 English is aligned with many aspects of the sustainability that give a more inclusive view of sustainable development. The study suggested further emphasis on economic dimension to prepare the students with the knowledge and skills that align with the economic sustainability.
ARTICLE HISTORY Date of Submission: 10-04-2024 Date of Acceptance: 16-05-2024 Date of Publication: 18-05-2024	 © 2024 Journal of Social Research Development
Correspondence	Muhammad Jamil
Email:	m.jamil@gcwus.edu.pk
DOI	https://doi.org/10.53664/JSRD/05-02-2024-01-01-13

INTRODUCTION

The sustainability concept has increasingly come to forefront of contemporary society, challenging the narrow confines of traditional environmental preservation and adopting an all-encompassing approach to saving the earth's resources for future generations (Tavanti, 2010). According to Amin, Zaman and Tok (2023), upcoming generations can have required knowledge, skills, and mentality to face current social, environmental and economic issues. The standing of education in promoting

sustainable development is widely acknowledged. As stated by [UNESCO \(2017\)](#), education is seen as a key component for achieving sustainability. The educational curricula and textbooks provide enormously influential platform for the transmission of knowledge and the skills and competencies required for addressing sustainability challenges from different dimensions in order to meet desired consequences. Therefore, embedding sustainability into textbooks, across all subjects, and curricula is becoming an increasing academic focus for institutions. Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) is about the attitudes and values that enable them to make informed decisions in an equality and equity generation.

It is about the global social economic and political implications of sustainability issues, engaging learners in issues to enhance individual and collective action. It equips learners of all ages with the skills and competencies to be active participants in sustainable development through their choices and actions. It is about empowerment and action for a worthwhile future. ESD inspires examination of values, behaviour and lifestyles to change them to abilities to address present and even mitigate future recognized and unforeseen environmental and societal problems ([UNESCO, 2017](#)). Education has long been recognized as central to shaping of students' attitudes, behaviours, and perspectives, and hence central to their potential actions, behaviours, and decision-making in addressing present and even mitigating future problems ([Ortega, Centeno & Corbi, 2020](#)). In this sense, textbooks are one of most frequently used education tools, assumed to represent curriculum content, by reflecting curriculum content they suggest how to learn ([Silva, Gomes, Carvalho & Geraldes, 2021](#)). [UNESCO \(2017\)](#), explains that ESD is meeting the social, economic, and environmental imperatives of present generation securing the chances of the same in the future without keeping a difference to our usual culturally varied practices.

This multi-faceted concept incorporates several aspects including the environment, society, culture, economics and politics, aesthetics, and even personal morality into one comprehensive blueprint called sustainable development. Notably, education has been at center of cultivating sustainability in people's minds, imparting knowledge, creating attitudes, and influencing behaviors since they are exposed to socialization from earliest stage of their lives. ESD is a coin between the social and environmental career means of teaching & learning that could go along with traditional curriculum as means of assessment, teaching methods and learning surroundings ([Ahmad, Troconis, Ibahrine, Armour, Tait, Reedy, Dale, Tasler & Inzolia, 2023](#)). Pakistan recently introduced [Single National Curriculum \(SNC\) 2022](#). It is a important reform in country's education because it is going to bring curriculum alignment and standardization among all provinces and territories. SNC also highlights to integration of the literacy of sustainability concepts and values throughout the curriculum. The significance of Grade 5 English textbook under [SNC 2022](#) framework is important. It is vital since English is international language and it is one of languages used in Pakistani educational system as a medium for instruction.

The content and pedagogical approach in textbook would directly affect students' understanding of sustainability linked with the responsibility, environment and resources, social equity, cultural preservation, ethical decision making, and might have impacts on their attitudes and behaviours towards responsible resource utilization, social equity, cultural preservation, and ethical decision

making. Study analyses Grade-5 English Textbook using [Tavanti \(2010\)](#) sustainability framework, comprising six dimensions, namely environmental, social, economic, institutional, cultural & values. It helps in assessing that whether textbook presents a balanced perspective on sustainability issues by checking how well the content aligns with curriculum standards for Grade-V English education. It helps to review any accompanying teacher support materials to provide guidance upon how to effectively teach about sustainable development. It is expected that the outcomes of study will help policymakers, curriculum developers and educational stake holders to reflect upon current English textbooks. It is expected that they will ponder over areas where education needs to be improved. It is hoped that findings will have implications for the integration of sustainability concepts in all the subjects of the school.

Objectives of Study

- To analyze the integration of sustainability dimensions in the English textbook for Grade 5 in particular context.
- To identify strengths, gaps, and areas for improvement within textbook to enhance effective integration of sustainability.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The notion of sustainability has received significant recognition in recent years as a key principle for tackling the increasingly complex challenges relating to global society. The endeavor to ensure sustainable development endeavors to strike careful balance between meeting the needs of present generation, and not compromising future generation's ability to provide for their needs. This multi-dimensional subject encompasses range of interrelated dimensions, dimensions commonly referred to as environment, social, economic, institutional, cultural and values, a view in which five of these factors are advanced in a well-known later model, hence this definition will expand on this model to give a comprehensive framework in which long term prosperity and well-being can be achieved. The importance of education in nurturing sustainability has been widely acknowledged by scholars and international organizations ([UNESCO, 2017](#)). Indeed, United Nations Educational, Scientific & Cultural Organization underscores central role played by Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) as a tool to embed the knowledge, skills, attitudes and values required to shape a sustainable future ([UNESCO, 2017](#)).

Textbooks, as the primary educational resources, importantly shape the students' understanding of sustainability and influence their attitudes and behaviours towards responsible resource utilisation, social justice, and ethical decision-making. Thus, several studies have investigated the presence of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in educational curricula and materials in different educational levels and disciplines. For instance, a systematic review conducted by [Silva et al. \(2021\)](#) found that there were some studies related to integrating sustainability into educational textbooks across inclusive levels and areas, but mostly towards environmental dimension, addressing climate change and pollution, and falling in nearly all cases short of addressing the social and economic sustainability themes. The research also consistently has confirmed importance of interdisciplinary approaches; learning by doing to develop sustainable problem-solving skills; fostering the critical thinking, integrating cognitive, affective, and behavioral domains concerning sustainability issues

(Lozano, Lukman, Lozano, Huisinigh & Lambrechts, 2013). Textbooks play variety of roles within the context of ESD for many reasons. Sustainable development has already been conducted in different regions of the world.

Research carried out by Nishimura et al. (2021) on how sustainability was represented in science textbooks used in Brazilian schools, shows that environmental sustainability has continued to be the dominant aspect of sustainability in science textbooks used in Brazilian school with social, economic and most notably, cultural dimensions of sustainability to yet to reach average level representation. Bandh et al. (2021) examined the global climate change as be sustainable development that is a multidimensional study. Also, Tahtahoglu and Kulac (2019) stated that education for sustainable development is necessary research in Turkey, but environmental events in sustainable development points are very low in the world. Bromley et al. (2011) taught report on sustainability issues through social studies textbooks in USA. Based on these studies, sustainability issues had been explained to followers instead of main theme, but not all topics rather than a certain kind of theme in curriculum. Unlikely Nkwetisama (2011) pronounced that awareness is raised about raising of environmental issues over English language Textbooks in Cameroon. Hence, his statistical evidence is significant, but contextual evidence of explaining the environmental issues in the English language Textbooks are identical weak.

National Curriculum in 2006 intends to integrate sustainability across different subjects including English Language (Ministry of Education, 2006) but, few studies have been found on sustainability integration in English language education in Pakistan context, Khalil et al. (2023) studied syllabus of BS English for incorporation of sustainable development which recommended for reviewing the well-established curriculum to incorporate sustainable development together with 21st-century skills applying content analysis method. Recent studies have been conducted for the integration of sustainability education in English textbooks for grades VIII, IX & X (Jamil, Anwar & Sohail, 2024; Jamil, Nosheen & Saleem, 2024; Jamil, Rasool & Moin, 2024). They used Tavanti's framework for incorporating Sustainability. According to the English textbook for the grade VIII based on a single national curriculum, it was found that the social, environmental, cultural and values aspects were promoted through different units. Thus, the institutional dimension was missing. It was found that Grade IX English level book incorporated social, environmental, institutional, cultural, and value-based sustainability while in the Grade X English book, social and cultural aspects of sustainability are found to be incorporated and lesser in the economic, environmental, climate change as well as institutional sustainability.

In the same way, recent studies have been conducted on sustainability in Pakistan Studies at grade X and XII books (Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil et al., 2024). According to the findings of the 10th grade Pakistan studies textbook, there is partial coverage of economic, social, cultural & value dimensions of sustainability with about non-existent institutional and environmental dimensions. The analysis of the textbook for grade XII found the presence of social, cultural and value-based sustainability properly, still, economic and institutional sustainability is better to improve. Hinduja, Mohammad, Siddiqui, Noor and Hussain (2023) and also, Kalsoom and Khanam (2017) conducted systematic research on the sustainability in higher education institutes and pre-service teacher education in

Pakistan in which they found that education policy raises the awareness of sustainability but is not enough to understand the root causes and its consequences of such issues hence, they also suggest for integrating the community engaged content, action research as well as critical reflection on the Sustainability in teacher education programs. In addition, [Malik, Khan, Chofreh, Goni, Klemes and Alotaibi \(2019\)](#), investigated the students' awareness of sustainability in the context of technology education and thus found that curriculum does not incorporate the much of the relevant diverse sustainability dimensions.

Studies on Higher Education Institutes (HEIs) in Pakistan about sustainability have been working ([Habib, Khalil, Khan & Zahid, 2021](#); [Hinduja et al., 2023](#)) while teacher education for sustainability has investigated ([Jumani & Abbasi, 2015](#)) the incorporation of Sustainable Development Goal-4 (Quality Education) for inclusiveness in changing the representation of developing issues ([Khushik & Diemer, 2020](#)) and the research on effect of sustainable Education on attitude of teachers about sustainable development has also been done ([Jumani & Abbasi, 2015](#); [Nousheen et al., 2020](#)) but, major barriers like weak governance, uncertainty, and limited resources have been identified for the sustainability in Pakistan ([Bukhari et al., 2022](#)). [Hussain and Hussain \(2023\)](#) commented on alignment between SDGs (Sustainable Development Goals) and SNC, (Single National Curriculum) after implementation in Pakistan. The SNC 2022 has changed integration of sustainability ([Hussain & Hussain, 2023](#)). In this linking, the present study shows how sustainability principles were not completely integrated into the new curriculum and were not in every school subject. Most of the emphasis was placed on social studies and science. The SDGs and SNC were well enough integrated but for sustainability to be worked effectively this research says the change must dominate into every School subject.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The present study employed a qualitative content analysis approach for investigating the English textbook (grade 5), under the Single National Curriculum (SNC) 2022, in the light of [Tavanti \(2010\)](#) Sustainability Framework. Qualitative content analysis is used to get key ideas in large text data, its main points and patterns in a general sense ([Kyngäs, 2020](#)). Textbook was selected, for analysis, purposively because it plays an important role in understanding of students regarding the concept of sustainability, and these are in line with national priorities in the education of Pakistan. The data for this investigation was collected from the English textbook (grade 5) published by the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board (PCTB). In this drive, to analyze qualitative data, researchers made use of NVivo 12 which facilitates researchers to organize, code & analyze text data systematically and rigorously. This method of data analysis has been used by many researchers ([Jackson, Bazeley & Bazeley, 2019](#)).

It helps to identify patterns, themes and relationships in the data while not being burdened by its volume ([Zamawe, 2015](#)). To start with, the grade 5 English textbook was read to get the idea and understanding of the subject matter. Once reading was done, the English textbook was imported into NVivo 12, and the coding scheme was developed based on Tavanti's Sustainability Framework. This framework encompasses the six dimensions of sustainability: environmental, social, economic, institutional, cultural and values. Thus, data is coded, and categorized and patterns are identified

alongside (Silver & Woolf, 2018). After creating coding scheme, each page and/or paragraph was read carefully followed by assigning and tagging codes to each text segment that related to each dimension of sustainability.

FINDINGS OF STUDY

Environmental Dimension

The textbook points out the importance of environmental sustainability and the pressing need to address climate change, pollution, and endangered species. The book offers ways for students to be more environmentally friendly and what they can do to practice environmental ethics. Following are some examples in this regard. Unit 5, "Amazing Planet", from pages 45-53, touches on concerns of climate change, pollution, and decreasing resources. Page 99 shows a chart, titled "How to Keep our Environment Safe and Clean", from textbook which the text points out that the list is not only there for students to acknowledge the problems, but to act upon them. The list includes actions like keeping environment clean, saving water, saving electricity, practising the 3R, and planting trees. And, on pages 116-124, a chapter of the textbook "Our National Animal", focuses on the national animal of the Markhor and why it is significant to preserve this endangered species. In this drive, the students learn what threats Markhor faces, including habitat loss and hunting, and what needs to be done to protect them.

Social Dimension

The textbook of English Grade V has focused on gender equality, empathy, and social responsibility to adopt a socially sustainable approach. On the other hand, helping and giving value to others and demonstrating the significance of women like in chapter, Women as Role Models and the unit Let's Be Helpful underlies values that textbook authors think are consistent with social sustainability. This text showed the acts of life such as assisting others, how to treat the people we meet, and their contribution towards society from different parameters. For example, by referring to the example of role of women in Pakistan, Women as social sustainability. Examples of this section refer to women like Fatima Jinnah, Dr. Ruth Pfau, Arfa Karim Randhawa, and Samina Baig and their contributions in various fields. Chapter No. 11, Let's Be Helpful also exhibits how students make much assistance to someone in need when someone falls into some adverse condition. In this drive, it demonstrates that their concern with diverse issues like empathy, inclusion, responsibility to the environment and justice are important.

Economic Dimension

There are also aspects in analyzed textbook that address indirectly economic sustainability. These aspects are probably not indicated directly but have emerged. It speaks, for instance, several times of a healthy and balanced diet (for example, in chapter "A Fit and Healthy Life", pp. 54-63). When people eat healthily, they have better health and the whole workforce is fit and healthy. Therefore, the economic cost of the health services drops considerably due to certain reasons in diverse leading situations. In another chapter (Let's Become Helpful, pp. 107 - 115) it is suggested that people save money, in order then to be able to buy what they want, or rather, to behave responsibly, to consume in a considered way.

Institutional Dimension

According to institutional dimension, the textbook promotes cultural and national values, promotes institutional policies, and encourages national pride, celebrations and significant historical events related to the country or area incorporated in the book. As per findings, Unit 9 'Patriotism' (pp. 83-93) celebrates Pakistan's independence, in response to which every Pakistani would become proud of its nationhood. It is also in line with the institutional policies and values as it coincides with the policies of the nation. For example, page no. 87 explains the importance of the 'Lahore Resolution' or 'Pakistan Resolution' the said resolution passed in 1940 and proposed creation of an independent state for the Muslims. In this connection, the textbook addresses related national events and cultural celebrations, e.g., Eid-ul-Azha in 10 units (p. 94-104.), which is in line with the institutional as well as cultural values.

Cultural & Values Dimensions

This textbook recognizes Pakistan's cultural diversity and traditions over various lessons & activities. It encourages the preservation and appreciation of Pakistan's rich cultural heritage. An example of this can be seen in unit "Eid-ul-Azha" on pages 94-104 where significance of this religious festival is detailed in terms of the Pakistani culture. This text highlights the cultural and spiritual aspects of Pakistani society. Also, this textbook includes poems, stories, and themes that celebrate Pakistani culture, traditions, and values, an example would be lesson "Our National Animal" (Unit 12, pages 116-124) where markhor, Pakistan's national animal, is the focus. Textbook emphasizes importance of fundamental values and spirituality in achieving a sustainable society. It promotes the nurturing of virtues such as patience, honesty and respect which are fundamental to the overall well-being of an individual and society. For example, Unit 8 which is titled "Do What's Right" (pp. 75-82) stresses the value of honesty and integrity. It advocates for students to make ethical decisions and do what is right, especially in difficult situations. Several lessons and themes within textbook promote virtues that are needed values like kindness, empathy, responsibility & respect that are required to nurture a sustainable society.

DISCUSSION

The analysis of the Grade 5 English textbook that is formulated under [Single National Curriculum 2022](#), over [Tavanti \(2010\)](#), Sustainability Framework, has revealed that it comprehensively covers various aspects of sustainability. In this context, the textbook's content and methodology indicate a comprehensive perspective towards cultivating sustainable development which is aligned with the national priority of Pakistan and international responsibilities of tackling global challenges. The textbook shows a remarkable focus on the critical element of environmental sustainability. This is apparent in environmental awareness units like Amazing Plant (unit 5) and 'Our National Animal' (Unit 12). It is judged by the following themes such as climate change, pollution, deforestation, and specific reference to vulnerable species: markhor, the national animal of Pakistan. Moreover, the textbook also carries potential to educate students on an eco-friendly atmosphere, a key to saving deteriorating environment and concerned party position by following the responsible management of resources and biodiversity conservation as suggested by [Tavanti \(2010\)](#). According to previous latest studies, English textbook for Grade VIII has provided environmental aspect coverage over

text (Jamil et al., 2024); separate unit for noise pollution and awareness about environmental issues (Jamil et al., 2024).

On the other hand, there is inadequate coverage of the environmental dimension for English and Pakistan Studies textbooks for grade X (Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil et al., 2024) in Pakistani context. The textbook under analysis is effective in directing social attribute of sustainability as it promotes values of social justice. For example, the unit, Women as Role Models in the textbook is an example of focusing on gender equality by emphasizing the accomplishments and role models of women in Pakistan. Likewise, chapter 'Let's Be Helpful' of textbook addresses issues of social responsibility, kindness, support, and empathy for others. These findings are in line with social dimensions outlined by Tavanti (2010). The textbook's recognition of Pakistan rich cultural heritage and diversity aligns with cultural dimension of sustainability advocated by Tavanti (2010). In the previous recent study for textbook grade VIII, for English, textbook promoted tolerance, harmony, and respect for others in social values (Jamil et al., 2024). In textbook of English for grade IX, social issues like women rights and drug addiction are addressed to promote empathy, equality, and social responsibility for social sustainability (Jamil et al., 2024). English textbook for grade X different values and social issues are dyed like equality, promoting justice, and moral values in society that emphasize trust, honesty, and keeping the promises.

In another book of Pakistan Studies textbook for the grade X, different aspects like healthcare and education are mentioned (Jamil et al., 2024). The textbook chosen does not openly focus upon the economic aspects of sustainability. However, many of the values and skills raised in the textbook can affect economic development. For example, the lesson "A Fit and Healthy Life" highlights the importance of a healthy lifestyle. A healthy population is more productive and will not be such an economic burden in terms of health care costs. Also, the unit "Let's Be Helpful", directly encourages saving money, which is an indicator of economic literacy. It demonstrates that while the economy is not as well represented as the environmental and social dimensions it is not as absent as one may think. It appears that while it is not explicitly shown to the students, the authors have the right idea concerning the connection between sustainable practices, personal well-being, as well as economic implications. However, a little more explicit inclusion of economic content can be a very good idea. This is seen when looking at the work of Tavanti (2010) where the emphasis is on the need to make sustainable development work not just in terms of the environment and socially, but also financially and economically. In this drive, according to previous studies, for English textbooks for grades VIII, IX, and X, there is no direct focus on economic sustainability (Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil et al., 2024; Jamil et al., 2024).

On the other hand, in another study for the Pakistan Studies textbook for grade X, the textbook has a chapter on economic development but lacks in-depth aspects of sustainability (Jamil et al., 2024). The alignment of provided textbook is highlighted in the institutional dimension of sustainability by incorporating national events, policies, and initiatives that fortify the Pakistan's commitment to sustainable development. The lesson Patriotism (Unit 9) celebrated the commemoration of country's independence and promoted the elite pride aligning with the institutional policies and values of Pakistan. Moreover, the textbook incorporates cultural celebrations like Eid-ul-Azha (Unit 10) that

justify its endorsement of the institutional and cultural values that prevail in Pakistani society. The exemptions are in urine with the principles of institutional dimension that are intricate by [Tavanti \(2010\)](#) in his avow, which focused on integration of sustainability in mainstream policy mechanisms and institutional frameworks. Thus, by rigor of national origin and cultural values, some people will determine the functions of their government and their institutional responsibility as regards the promotion of sustainable development. In this linking, this addresses the need for complicity and an interdisciplinary approach as posited by the scholars like [Hussain and Hussain \(2023\)](#). In a recent study by [Jamil et al. \(2024\)](#), the textbook of English grade VIII does not address the institutional integration of sustainability.

In another study of English textbook grade IX, the textbook explores the role of institutions like environmental protection agencies in setting and enforcing environmental standards highlighting the institutional dimension of sustainability ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)). In a study by [Jamil et al. \(2024\)](#), the textbook indirectly mentions the role of institutions and governance in dispensing the justice and upholding the but it does not investigate the meaningful institutional frameworks and governance procedures necessary for sustainable development. In another study regarding textbook of Pakistan Studies grade X, there is limited discussion upon the promotion of Pakistan's institutions regarding sustainable development across social, economic, and environmental domains ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)). Lessons such as "Eid-ul-Azha" (Unit 10) and "Our National Animal" (Unit 12) underline importance of cultural traditions, values, and symbols, promoting respect for diverse practices, and stressing the significance of cultural preservation in achieving sustainable development. Thus, by incorporating cultural elements and celebrating Pakistan's diverse traditions, and cultures, textbook develops an appreciation for the desired inherent relationships between cultural diversity and sustainability, as underscored by organizations like the United Nations Permanent Forum on the indigenous people ([Tavanti, 2010](#)).

In previous recent studies, textbook covers cultural diversity through different aspects like national address, Pakistani culture, language and historical landmarks ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)), national identity, cultural heritage, and shared values are discussed in different units of the book ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)). Cultural and traditional values are explored in different units ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)). Another study of Pakistan Studies textbook grade X, there is included the unit that highlights different aspects like religious uniformity, social values, and cultural heritage ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)). It is evident throughout the textbook that several activities, concepts, and indicators reinforce ethical dimension ([Tavanti, 2010](#)). The activities in textbook are expected to instill in students ethical & spiritual underpinnings that would rouse the interest of the students to embark on sustainable development paths, as well as make informed choices for welfare of current and future generations. Incorporating Education for sustainable development into formal education systems, and lifelong learning opportunities is vital for building more sustainable future. Previous studies textbook focuses on moral values, spirituality and personal progress with compassion, integrity, righteousness, loyalty, moral conduct and justice ([Jamil et al., 2024](#); [Jamil et al., 2024](#); [Jamil et al., 2024](#)). On the other hand, in textbook of Pakistan Studies for grade X, there is no explicit discussion on values & spiritual dimension of sustainability ([Jamil et al., 2024](#)).

CONCLUSION

The current study findings focus upon environmental sustainability prompting awareness of major issues like climate change, pollution, deforestation, and conservation of endangered species. Also, textbook encourages students to adopt eco-friendly practices and accept personal responsibility for safeguarding the environment commensurate with principles of responsible resource utilization and biodiversity conservation. The social dimension of sustainability which is essentially based on the principles of social justice, equality, empathy, and tolerance has been very well incorporated in the given textbook. Although the economic dimension is not as pronounced as the ecological and social aspects of sustainability, it undoubtedly manifests itself in book over activities allowing children to make inferences around the importance of adopting sustainable practices to ensure personal well-being and economic development of the country. By equipping learners with the knowledge, skills, and values needed to address the sustainability challenges, ESD plays a crucial role in empowering individuals and communities to create sustainable and equitable world. The institutional dimension of sustainability on the other hand is less evident in the textbook apart from sporadic inclusions of national events, policies, and initiatives all of which serve to highlight the commitment of Pakistan to sustainable development.

Similarly, the cultural dimension of sustainability has not been extensively addressed in textbook apart from occasional inclusion of various traditional practices and cultural diversity, the purpose of which is to instil values of respect for diverse practices and to stress need for culture preservation so concept of culture continuity could be upheld. However, the textbook does very well in touching on a critical component of sustainability which is the essential values and spirituality upon which the entire concept of sustainability is built. The two lessons motivate students to be patient, honest, kind, and respectful to themselves and others to promote personal and collective well-being. The textbook provides activities that emphasize the values-orientation and spiritual development, both internal foundations for sustainable society. The current study holds the significant implications for policymakers, curriculum developers, and educational stakeholders in Pakistan. Broad integration of the sustainability dimensions in the English text of Grade 5 demonstrates an intent to foster a inclusive grasp of the sustainable development among students, starting from an early age of their cognitive development. Still, ensuring a consistent and balanced representation of all modes across different subjects and grade levels is imperative to further emphasize the interconnectedness that is inherent to these modes.

Recommendations

1. The curriculum should further incorporate sustainability in a balanced and more integrated manner across all subjects and levels of education to reflect the interconnectedness of the different aspects and better build comprehensive understanding of sustainable development among learners.
2. Textbooks and learning materials should be designed to include more hands-on activities, case studies, and projects and other innovative teaching and learning strategies to bridge the gap between theory and practice and between natural, social and economic dimensions of

- sustainable development, foster higher order thinking skills and problem-solving capacities among learners.
3. In-service training and continuous professional development programmes on Education for Sustainable Development targeting teachers, educators should be developed and organized, focusing more on sustainability contents, pedagogical approaches and the required resources to teach ESD.
 4. A mechanism for continuous review, updating and improvement of textbooks and learning materials should be put in place to ensure their relevance and responsiveness to emerging sustainability issues, global citizenship skills, technological advancements as well as evolving societal needs.
 5. Partnerships and cooperation between different educational stakeholders, including policy makers, curriculum developers, teacher trainees, teachers, researchers and other key persons in field of education for sustainable development should be fostered and strengthened at local, national and international levels.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, N., Troconis, M., Ibrahine, M., Armour, R., Tait, V., Reedy, K., Dale, V., Tasler, N., & Inzolia, Y. (2023). Codesigns education for sustainable development: A framework for embedding education for sustainable development in curriculum design. *Sustainability*, 15(23), 16460.
- Amin, H., Zaman, A., & Tok, E. (2023). The Education for sustainable development and global citizenship education in the GCC: a systematic literature review. *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 1-16.
- Bandh, A., Shafi, S., Peerzada, M., Rehman, T., Bashir, S., Wani, A., & Dar, R. (2021). Multidimensional analysis of global climate change: a review. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 28(20), 24872-24888.
- Bromley, P., Meyer, J. W., & Ramirez, F. O. (2011). Student-centeredness in social science textbooks, 1970-2008: A cross-national study. *Social Forces*, 90(2), 547-570.
- Bukhari, S., Gul, S. K. U. S. H., Seraj, R. I., & Mahbub, P. (2022). Barriers to sustainability at Pakistan public universities and the way forward. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 23(4), 865-886.
- Habib, M. N., Khalil, U., Khan, Z., & Zahid, M. (2021). Sustainability in higher education: what is happening in Pakistan? *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 22(3), 681-706.
- Hinduja, P., Mohammad, R. F., Siddiqui, S., Noor, S., & Hussain, A. (2023). Sustainability in higher education institutions in Pakistan: A systematic review of the progress and challenges. *Sustainability*, 15(4), 3406.
- Hussain, A., & Hussain, I. (2023). Sustainability assessment for construction projects: A cost-sustainability tradeoff approach. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 423, 138727.
- Jackson, K., Bazeley, P., & Bazeley, P. (2019). *Qualitative data analysis with NVivo*. Sage.
- Jamil, M., Anwar, F., & Sohail, H. (2024). Unlocking sustainability: Evaluating the sustainability education in English textbook. *Journal of Social Sciences Development*, 3(2), 1-13.

- Jamil, M., Mehmood, W., & Aslam, A. (2024). Sustainability education in Pakistan: A qualitative content analysis of the 10th grade Pakistan Studies textbook. *Voyage Journal of Educational Studies (VJES)*, 4(2), 80-95.
- Jamil, M., Nosheen, S. S., & Saleem, A. (2024). Sustainability education in Pakistan: Qualitative content analysis of English textbook grade X. *Journal of Social & Organizational Matters (JSOM)*, 3(2), 1-11.
- Jamil, M., Rasool, S., & Moin, M. (2024). Sustainability Education in English Textbook Grade VIII Based On SNC (2022). *International Journal of Social Science & Entrepreneurship*, 4(2), 180-196.
- Jamil, M., Yousaf, A., & Naqvi, S. U. e. L. (2024). Enhancing sustainability education in Pakistan: Analysis of Pakistan Studies textbook grade XII. *International Journal of Contemporary Issues in Social Sciences*, 3(2), 1039-1046.
- Jumani, N. B., & Abbasi, F. (2015). Teacher education for sustainability in Pakistan. *Journal on Innovation and Sustainability RISUS*, 6(1), 13-19.
- Kalsoom, Q., & Khanam, A. (2017). Inquiry into sustainability issues by preservice teachers: A pedagogy to enhance sustainability consciousness. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 164, 1301-1311.
- Khalil, A., Baig, S., & Javed, F. (2023). The Application of Sustainable Development Goal 4 (Quality Education) in BS English Language & Literature Curriculum. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 7(4), 711-717.
- Khushik, F., & Diemer, A. (2020). Education and sustainability, how sdg4 contributes to change the representations of developing issues? The case study of Pakistan. *International Journal of Management and Sustainability*, 9(2), 101-119.
- Kyngäs, H. (2020). Qualitative research and content analysis. In *The application of content analysis in nursing science research* (pp. 3-11). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-30199-6_1.
- Lozano, R., Lukman, R., Lozano, F. J., Huisinigh, D., & Lambrechts, W. (2013). The Declarations for sustainability in higher education: becoming better leaders, through addressing the university system. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 48, 10-19.
- Malik, M. N., Khan, H. H., Chofreh, A. G., Goni, F. A., Klemes, J. J., & Alotaibi, Y. (2019). Investigating students' sustainability awareness and the curriculum of technology education in Pakistan. *Sustainability*, 11(9), 2651.
- Nishimura, A. Z., Moreira, A., Yong-Oliveira, M., & Sousa, M. J. (2021). Effectiveness of the Portugal 2020 programme: a study from the citizens' perspective. *Sustainability*, 13(11), 5799.
- Nkwetisama, C. M. (2011). EFL/ESL and Environmental Education: Towards an Eco-Applied Linguistic Awareness in Cameroon. *World Journal of Education*, 1(1), 110-118.
- Nousheen, A., Zai, A. Y., Waseem, M., & Khan, S. A. (2020). Education for sustainable development: Effects of sustainability education on pre-service teachers' attitude towards sustainable development (SD). *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 250, 119537.
- Ortega, D., Centeno, A., & Corbi, M. (2020). Socio-environmental problematic, end-purposes, and strategies relating to education for sustainable development (ESD) through the perspectives of Spanish secondary education trainee teachers. *Sustainability*, 12(14), 5551.

- Silva, G. M., Gomes, P. J., Carvalho, H., & Geraldês, V. (2021). Sustainable development in small and medium enterprises: The role of entrepreneurial orientation in supply chain management. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 30(8), 3804-3820.
- Silver, C., & Woolf, H. (2018). From guided-instruction to facilitation of learning: the development of Five-level QDA as a CAQDAS pedagogy that explicates the practices of expert users. In *The Teaching and Learning of Social Research Methods* (pp. 83-100). *Routledge*.
- Tahtalioglu, H., & Kulac, O. (2019). The Role of Education in Realizing Sustainable Development in Turkey. *Agathos: An International Review of the Humanities & Social Sciences*, 10(1), 201-229.
- Tavanti, M. (2010). The Integrated Frameworks and Pillars of Sustainability. In: Depaul University.
- UNESCO. (2017). Education for sustainable development goals: Learning objectives. In: Unesco Paris, France.
- Zamawe, F. C. (2015). The implication of using NVivo software in qualitative data analysis: Evidence-based reflections. *Malawi Medical Journal*, 27(1), 13-15.